

**University of Melbourne Student Union**

**Meeting of the Clubs & Societies Committee**

**Unconfirmed Minutes 20**

**12 pm Monday November 25**

**Meeting 20/24**

**Location:**

**Room 301, Building 168 and Zoom (details available on request)**

**Azalea Rohaizam opened the meeting 12:04 pm.**

1. **Procedural Matters**
   1. Election of Chair

**Procedural Motion 1: To make Alessandra Negline chair.**

Mover: Patrick Irwin

**Carried**

**Motion 1: To elect Azalea Rohaizam as chair.**

Mover: Hanny Teja Seconder: Esther Luk

**Not considered**

* 1. Acknowledgement of Indigenous Owners

So acknowledged.

* 1. Attendance

C&S Officers: Hanny, Azalea

C&S Committee: Tarish Kadam, Esther Luk, Ewan Bezzobs, Patrick Irwin, Alessandra Negline, Clarita Youkanna

Staff: Fiona Sanders, Melanie Gunton

Others:

Choral Society: Jack Malasek, Alexander Goryachev, Arwen Cropley, Izan Cantero Herrera, Benjamin Larcombe-Brooks, Miriam Ellemor-Collins, Henry Smith, Gary Fan, Peter Harris (non-student), Renata Ware (non-student), Lachlan Perry, Tim Kopka, Sara Suiter (RMIT Student), Andrew Wailes (non-student) Annika McGushin-Deak

Alex Gwynn (proxy), Nina Tieu (Kpop Club), Boxiao Wu (X-crew City Walking Association)

* 1. Grant speaking rights to Coordinator (Standing Order 21.2)

**Motion 2: To grant speaking rights to the C&S Coordinator and Administration Officer, Fiona Sanders and Melanie Gunton under Standing Order 21.2.**

Mover: Chair

**CWD**

* 1. Apologies

Leon Paratz.

* 1. Proxies

Esther Luk to Alex Gwynn for 4.1.1.

Leon Paratz to Tarish Kadam

* 1. Membership

No changes

* 1. Adoption of Agenda

**Motion 3: To adopt the agenda as presented.**

Mover: Chair

**Carried**

1. **Confirmation of Previous Minutes**
   1. October 23, 2024

Esther submitted a list of corrections.

- Motion 5: 'Media' is spelled wrong (Medica)

- Motion 6: remove ' ti the formal warning'

- Motion 10: replace 'groupd of the hold' with 'grounds of not holding'

- Motion 12: 'Paiting' is spelled wrong

**Motion 4: To accept the amended Minutes of October 23rd as a True & Accurate record.**

Mover: Chair

**CWD**

1. **Conflicts of interest**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Conflicts of Interest declared** |
| Alessandra Negline | Catholic Society, Very Special Kids Society |
| Patrick Irwin | Liberal Club, Pre-Law Society |
| Leon Paratz | Society for Astronomy, Physics Students Society, Media and Communications Students Society, Jewish Students Society |
| Clarita Youkanna | Pre-Law Society |
| Esther Luk | Ring of Choir, Apollo Music Society |
| Azalea Rohaizam | Swifties Society |
| Hanny Teja | Nil |
| Ewan Bezzobs | Science Students Society |

Esther Luk declared Choral Society as a conflict.

Tarish Kadam declared Language Exchange Club as a conflict.

Alex Gwynn declared Swifties Society as a conflict.

1. **Matters arising from the Minutes**
   1. Discipline

**Procedural Motion 2: To discuss 4.1.9. X-crew City Walking Association.**

Mover: Azalea Rohaizam

**CWD**

4.1.9 X-crew City Walking Association

Petitioned last meeting: To put X-Crew City Walking Association on probation for 12 months for failing to give full Notice of the AGM (R 6.3.i (R5.2.b)) and for deliberately breaching its own constitution and the Regulations by voting on and enacting a Constitutional amendment before it was approved by C&S (R.6.3.e, R6.3.a (5.1.b)).

Petitioned by Esther Luk, Ewan Bezzobs

Boxiao spoke to the Committee: They did not understand the requirements of an AGM. The members are aware that there was an issue.

**Motion 5: To uphold the petition to put X-Crew City Walking Association on probation for 12 months for failing to give full Notice of the AGM (R 6.3.i (R5.2.b)) and for deliberately breaching its own constitution and the Regulations by voting on and enacting a Constitutional amendment before it was approved by C&S (R.6.3.e, R6.3.a (5.1.b)).**

Mover: Patrick Irwin Seconder: Ewan Bezzobs

**CWD**

**Procedural Motion 3: To consider 4.1.10 Kpop Club.**

Mover: Azalea Rohaizam

**CWD**

**Boxiao Wu left at 12:15 pm**

4.1.10 Kpop Club

Petitioned last meeting: To put the Kpop Club on probation for 6 months for breaching the Regulations and their own constitution by holding an inquorate AGM (R6.3.a (5.2.e.iv.A), 6.3.e)

Petitioned by Ewan Bezzobs & Esther Luk

**Clarita arrived at 12:16 pm**

Probation explained by Committee.

Nina spoke to the Committee: Reiterated that it was an error by the club, 20 people were present but not all student members.

**Motion 6: To uphold the petition to put the Kpop Club on probation for 6 months for breaching the Regulations and their own constitution by holding an inquorate AGM (R6.3.a (5.2.e.iv.A), 6.3.e).**

Mover: Tarish Kadam Seconder: Ewan Bezzobs

**CWD**

**Nina Tieu left at 12:22 pm**

* + 1. Choral Society

Noting Esther’s proxy to Alex Gwynn is effective.

Petitioned last meeting: To disaffiliate the Melbourne University Choral Society on the grounds of R6.3.u for not providing an environment free from bullying for all members

Petitioned by Patrick Irwin, Gevindu Wickramanayake, Clarita Youkanna, Esther Luk, Nhareish Nakamuthu

**Procedural Motion 4: To go in camera including Coordinator & Administration Officer.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs

**CWD**

**Meeting went in camera at 12:30 pm**

**All strangers excluded.**

**Procedural Motion 5: To include Alexander Goryachev in camera.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs Seconder: Patrick Irwin

**CWD**

**Alexander Goryachev came in at 12:39 pm**

Asked who else he wanted to present with: Executive

**Alexander Goryachev left at 12:40 pm**

**Procedural Motion 6: To include Henry Smith in camera.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs Seconder: Patrick Irwin

**CWD**

**Henry Smith came in.**

**Henry Smith left.**

**Procedural Motion 7: To include Bejamin Larcombe-Brooks in camera.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs Seconder: Patrick Irwin

**CWD**

**Benjamin Larcombe-Brooks came in at 12:42 pm**

**Benjamin Larcombe-Brooks left.**

**Procedural Motion 8: To include Jack Malasek in camera.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs Seconder: Patrick Irwin

**CWD**

**Jack Malasek came in at 12:48 pm**

**Jack Malasek left.**

**Procedural Motion 9: To include Miriam Ellemor-Collins in camera.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs Seconder: Patrick Irwin

**CWD**

**Miriam Ellemor-Collins attended at 12:54 pm**

**Miriam Ellemor-Collins left at 1:10pm.**

**Procedural Motion 10: To include Arwen Cropley in camera.**

Mover: Azalea Rohaizam Seconder: Hanny Teja

**CWD**

**Arwen Cropley came in at 1:11 pm.**

**Arwen Cropley left at 1:18 pm.**

**Procedural Motion 11: To include Izan Cantero in camera.**

Mover: Hanny Teja

**CWD**

**Izan Cantero attended at 1:20 pm**

**Izan Cantero left at 1:35 pm**

**Procedural Motion 12: To include Renata Ware in camera.**

Mover: Azalea Rohaizam

**CWD**

**Renata Ware included at 1:36 pm**

**Renata Ware left at 1:55 pm**

**Procedural Motion 13: To cede the chair to Patrick Irwin.**

Mover: Alessandra Negline

**For: 4 Against: 2**

**Carried.**

**Procedural Motion 14: To include Gary Fan in camera.**

Mover: Chair

**CWD**

**Gary Fan came in at 1:59 pm**

**Gary Fan and Alessandra Negline left at 2:04pm**

**Break for 10 minutes, starting at 2:05pm**

**Meeting resumed at 2:26 pm**

**Procedural Motion 15: To include Lachlan Perry in camera.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs

**CWD**

**Lachlan Perry arrived at 2:27 pm**

**Lachlan Perry left at 2:34 pm**

**Procedural Motion 16: To include Tim Kopka in camera.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs

**CWD**

**Tim Kopka came in at 2:35 pm**

**Tim Kopka left at 2:45 pm**

**Procedural Motion 17: To include from Sara Suiter in camera** **and give her speaking rights.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs

**CWD**

**Sara Suiter entered at 2:46 pm**

**Sara Suiter left at 2:50 pm**

**Procedural Motion 18: To include Esther Luk in camera.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs

**CWD**

**Esther Luk entered at 2:50 pm**

**Esther Luk left at 3:15 pm**

**Procedural Motion 19: To include Andrew Wailes and give him speaking rights**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs

**CWD**

**Andrew Wailes arrived at 3:17 pm**

**Andrew Wailes left at 3:57 pm**

**Procedural Motion 20: To include the Executive (Alex, Henry & Ben) in camera.**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs

**CWD**

**Alex, Henry & Ben came in at 3:58 pm**

**Fiona left at 3:59pm and came back at 4:05pm**

**Alex, Henry & Benjamin left the room at 4:21pm.**

**Break at 4:21pm for 10 mins**

**Meeting resumed at 4:31pm**

Ewan reviewed the main points and the things that were said by the witnesses.

**Azalea Rohaizam left at 5:14 pm**

**Procedure Motion 21: To go out of camera.**

Mover: Tarish Kadam

**CWD**

**Hanny Teja left at 5:20 pm**

**Many members of Choral Society had left during camera.**

**Gary, Benjamin, Lachlan, Izan and Esther came back at 5:22 pm**

Summary of in camera discussions:

* Most of those attending denied the allegations of bullying, some of which claiming that they have never heard any derogatory comments made by Andrew Wailes, however there was confirmation that these types of derogatory comments have been frequently said.
* It was also confirmed that these comments were disproportionately directed at the altos.
* The executive committee did also bring a document to the meeting that the committee reviewed. The document included the list of alleged comments made by Andrew Wailes, each one being followed by either a denial or justification of the usage of each comment. It is important to note that an attempt to justify the usage of each comment is confirmation by Andrew Wailes himself that these comments have been made.

Patrick spoke to the doubt among the committee. He feels there are questions to be answered about the standard we are trying to meet.

Patrick wants meaning of 6.3.u. What are the actual standards. This has the ordinary, Victorian Fair Work meaning, and bullying has been reported and confirmed as occurring, even if some, or a majority of members, may not recognise it as such.

The committee found that there is a pattern of derogatory comments directed at one section of the choir, which constitutes bullying, and UMSU cannot maintain a relationship with a club that cultivates this environment, even if this is not the experience of all, or even most, members.

**To uphold the petition to disaffiliate the Choral Ssociety on basis if 6.3.u**

Mover: Ewan Bezzobs Seconder: Tarish Kadam

For: 4 Abstain: 1

**Carried**

**Melanie Gunton left at 5:34 pm**

The remainder of the Agenda is deferred to next meeting.

**Meeting closed at 5:35 pm**