



University of Melbourne Student Union

Meeting of the Students' Council

Agenda

Tuesday 29 September, 11:00am

Meeting 18(20)

Location: Zoom

<https://unimelb.zoom.us/j/96772820008?pwd=UTRpUzVOK05Oc3dqWkJTNmk3aUIQUOT09>

Password: 018051

Meeting opened at 1105 by Jack Buksh

1. Procedural Matters

1.1. Election of Chair

Motion 1: That the Chair be Jack Buksh

Mover: Jack Buksh

Seconder: Chris Melenhorst

CARRIED

1.2. Acknowledgement of Indigenous Custodians

So acknowledged

1.3. Attendance

Representatives on Students' Council	Full name	Attended?	Number of councils attended
Students of Colour Representative on Students' Council	Allen Xiao	Y	13
Students with Disabilities Representative on Students' Council	Max Dowell	Y	14
Queer Representative on Students' Council	Andie Moore	Y	10
International Student Representative on Students' Council	Tejas Gandhi	Y	12
Graduate Student Representative on Students' Council	Hayley Kebbell	Y	12
Students' Council (General Representative)	Evelyn Ranogajec	Y	13
Students' Council (General Representative)	Joshua Bruni	Y	11
Students' Council (General Representative)	Christopher Melenhorst	Y	14
Students' Council (General Representative)	Nick Reich	Y	10
Students' Council (General Representative)	Lachlan Hinds	N	13
Students' Council (General Representative)	Raiyaan Mahbub	Y	12

Students' Council (General Representative)	Felix Sharkey	N	10
Students' Council (General Representative)	VACANT		
Students' Council (General Representative)	Varaidzo Chipunza	Y	14
Students' Council (General Representative)	Hannah Krasovec	Y	12
Students' Council (General Representative)	Matthew Harper-Gomm	Y	13
Students' Council (General Representative)	Emma Dynes	Y	7
Students' Council (General Representative)	Rubina Smith	Y	2
Students' Council (General Representative)	Thonya Deverall	Y	13
Students' Council (General Representative)	Catriona Smith	Y	13
Indigenous Committee	Jess Ferrari-Thomas	Y	9

Office Bearers

Department	Full name	Attended?	Number of councils attended
President	Hannah Buchan	Y	14
General Secretary	Jack Buksh	Y	15
Activities Officer	India Pinkney	Y	11
Activities Officer	Hayley Stanford	N	10
Clubs & Societies Officer	Jordan Di Natale	Y	15
Creative Arts Officer	Emily White	Y	13
Creative Arts Officer	Olivia Bell	Y	12
Disabilities Officer	Hue Man Dang	N	11
Disabilities Officer	Srishti Chatterjee	N	8
Education (Academic Affairs) Officer	Joshua Munro	Y	14
Education (Academic Affairs) Officer	Georgia Walton Briggs	Y	13
Education (Public Affairs) Officer	Charlie Joyce	Y	13
Education (Public Affairs) Officer	Noni Bridger	Y	8
Environment Officer	Olivia Sullivan	Y	13
Environment Officer	Sophie Kerrigan	Y	11
Indigenous Officer	Hope Kuchel	Y	12
Indigenous Officer	Shanysa McConville	Y	11
Media Officer	Bethany Cherry	Y	11
Media Officer	Amber Meyer	Y	12
Media Officer	Sarah Peters	Y	13
Media Officer	Tharidi Walimunige	Y	13
People of Colour Officer	Nicole Nabbout	Y	13
People of Colour Officer	Gurpreet Singh	Y	14
Queer Officer	Ciara O'Sullivan	N	9
Queer Officer	A'bidah Zaid	Y	8
Welfare Officer	Natasha Guglielmino	Y	11

Women's Officer	Aria Sunga	Y	11
Women's Officer	Naomi Smith	Y	11
Burnley Campus Coordinator	Kaitlyn Hammond	N	8
VCA Campus Coordinator	Hayden Williams	N	10
VCA Campus Coordinator	Verity Crane	N	10

1.4. Apologies

Office Bearers: Hayden Williams, Amber Meyer, Hayley Stanford

Councillors: Lachlan Hinds

Leave of Absence Requests:

Nil.

Proxies

Lachlan Hinds to Harry Black

1.5. Membership

No change

1.6. Adoption of Agenda

Motion 2: That the Agenda as presented be adopted

Mover: Jack Buksh (Chair)

CARRIED

2. Confirmation of Previous Minutes

2.1 Minutes 17(20)

Motion 3: That the minutes of 17(20) be approved as a true and accurate record.

Mover: Jack Buksh (Chair)

CARRIED

3. Conflicts of Interest Declaration

Nil

4. Matters Arising from the Minutes

Nil

5. Correspondence

Nil

6. Office Bearer Reports

President	Hannah Buchan	<i>Submitted</i>
General Secretary	Jack Buksh	<i>Submitted</i>
Activities	India Pinkney	<i>Submitted</i>
	Hayley Stanford	<i>Submitted</i>
Clubs and Societies	Jordan Di Natale	<i>Submitted</i>
Creative Arts	Emily White	<i>Submitted</i>
	Olivia Bell	<i>Submitted</i>
Disabilities	Hue Man Dang	<i>Not Submitted</i>

	Srishti Chatterjee	<i>Submitted</i>
Education (Academic Affairs)	Georgia Walton Briggs	<i>Submitted</i>
	Joshua Munro	<i>Submitted</i>
Education (Public Affairs)	Charlie Joyce	<i>Not Submitted</i>
	Noni Bridger	<i>Submitted</i>
Environment	Sophie Kerrigan	<i>Submitted</i>
	Olivia Sullivan	<i>Submitted</i>
Indigenous	Hope Kuchel	<i>Submitted</i>
	Shanysa McConville	<i>Submitted, with recommendations</i>
Media	Bethany Cherry	<i>Submitted, with recommendations</i>
	Amber Meyer	<i>Submitted</i>
	Sarah Peters	<i>Submitted</i>
	Tharidi Walimunige	<i>Submitted</i>
People of Colour	Gurpreet Singh	<i>Submitted</i>
	Nicole Nabbout	<i>Submitted</i>
Queer	Ciara O'Sullivan	<i>Not Submitted</i>
	A'Bidah Zaid Shirbeeni	<i>Submitted</i>
Welfare	Natasha Guglielmino	<i>Not Submitted</i>
Women's	Naomi Smith	<i>Submitted</i>
	Aria Sunga	<i>Submitted</i>
Southbank	Verity Crane	<i>Submitted</i>
	Hayden Williams	<i>Submitted</i>
Burnley	Kaitlyn Hammond	<i>Not Submitted</i>

OB Verbal Reports

Charlie Joyce spoke as had not submitted a report. They've been collaborating with the Womens department, the No cuts campaign is gearing up and the session with the Victorian

Tree Smith asked Activities if all their trivia sessions will be run by Kahoots as it's not super accessible.

Chris suggested they extend the timing.

Tree asked Srishti why they had been providing advice on special consideration. Advocacy exists for this – the Disabilities Department does not. Asks for more clarification.

Jack Buksh will take this on notice as Srishti isn't here.

Hannah Krasovec asked if the Disabilities Department are making a submission to the Royal Commission. Jack Buksh to add this to questions on notice for next Council.

Tree asked for an Ed Ac update – any further on the meetings?

Georgia said that the meetings hadn't happened yet

Andie Moore asked Ed pub about what next steps they'll be doing regarding the cuts campaign.

Noni indicated they were meeting with the NTEU this afternoon so would have more info after that

India updated council on Oktoberfest – initial plans would have been regarding getting deals from local brewers etc and getting delivered but it may still be such a high risk. Kyle is working on recipes to make that are Oktoberfest themed.

Andie asked if PoC were doing anything else apart from Myriad. Gurpreet said they'd been campaigning for workers rights

Isabelle Horton asked Queer about their response to the NSW education legislation amendment bill that will ban content about gender diversity and trans people in schools. Jack will put on notice.

Hannah Krasovec asked A'bidah regarding actual progress in the campaign against TERFS working at the uni.

Jordan Di Natale asked for a Welfare Update – Tash indicated she'd been working on an event with UMSU INTL, as well as talking to Foodbank Vic about international students and food insecurity. Additionally, the online yoga has been so popular that the capacity has been increased.

Motion 4: That all OB reports be accepted

Mover: Jack Buksh (Chair)

CARRIED

Procedural Motion: That Council move in camera

Mover: Jack Buksh (Chair)

CARRIED

Council moved in camera at 1124

During this time, Council discussed and approved the CEO's report to Council

Out of camera at 1138

7. Other Reports

7.1. Student Union Advocacy Service Report May – August 2020

Jordan Di Natale asked if we knew how many students had benefitted from the WAP policy. Justin said that there was no way we could find that out.

Allen asked if there were updates on the GAMSAT issue – Academic Board was so narrowly voted down. GAMSAT companies are reporting that it's been reversed.

Hannah and Jack both indicated that it had not been reversed, and that the issue is being taken to Uni Council.

Chris Melenhorst asked about staffing levels in Advocacy with the extra work – Justin said that they'd had extra staff working in there from other parts of the organisation, and that the staff had been well supported throughout the process.

Chris said that he'd like it noticed that an upgrade from Kafkaesque to Seinfeld level was impressive.

7.2. UMSU Media Complaints and Disputes Panel

No further action

8. Operational Business

9. Motions on Notice

9.1. NUS Accreditation Fee

Platform:

In the UMSU Annual Elections, we elect 7 National Union of Students delegates. These delegates represent the University of Melbourne at the NUS National Conference, and UMSU pays for their attendance at the conference. In the 2020 Budget Memorandum, there is a budget line for Delegate Registration Fee & associated costs which totals \$7000. This is money that would have been paid to the NUS alongside our affiliation fee in a regular year.

UMSU has received confirmation that the NUS National Conference will not be going ahead as usual due to the restrictions in Victoria. We are yet to receive details about what online alternative will be held in its place, but that means that the National Union of Students – Delegates budget line cannot be spent since there is no in person conference. Therefore, this motion is suggesting that UMSU amalgamates that budget line with the Affiliations budget line in order for UMSU to still be able to provide this money to the NUS.

The 2020 UMSU Budget approved an NUS affiliation fee of \$65000, so the addition of this budget line to our affiliation fee would increase UMSU's affiliation to the NUS to \$72000. It is important now more than ever to support our National Union as it is the one body which can unite students around the country to fight cuts to our education.

As a bit of background info, affiliation is calculated based on how many full-time students a University has, of which the University of Melbourne has the highest. Most student unions (including us) do not pay the amount that we are supposed to since Voluntary Student Unionism slashed funding to Australia's student unions. Without proper funding, the NUS cannot function properly.

Discussion from many Councillors

Josh Bruni – does NUS get all the money from the Conference? Or will this be a windfall from them?

Hannah indicated that the conference is going ahead, but with people attending via zoom. Chris asked why we need to send more money to NUS when we've already given them \$72,000, and that this will be seen as a justification for further increases next year. Andie Moore asked for a clarification regarding costs spent on NatCon – is this just NUS profits? NUS is not providing UMSU with the usual service that we get. It's very important to support the NUS for next year, but not sure it's appropriate to move that money straight into affiliation. Concern regarding an NUS with only delegates was raised by multiple councillors. Hannah indicated this may not be the case – we don't yet know what NatCon will look like

Procedural motion: To defer this motion until we know more about what NatCon will look like Mover: Tree Smith MOTION FAILS
--

Hannah indicated that while \$65,000 is a lot of money, it worth it – it's the peak body that looks after all students. We're the richest Student Union in the country, and everyone has valid criticisms but if they don't have the money to function properly, we will see further disparity.

Multiple councillors spoke in favour of NUS funding and the work the NUS do at a federal level.

Procedural motion: To defer this motion until we learn more about the form NatCon will take in the expectation that that will inform the funding requirements Mover: Chris Melenhorst FAILED
--

Procedural motion: To move straight to a vote

Mover: Chris Melenhorst

CARRIED

Motion 7: That \$7000 be moved from the budget line *National Union of Students – Delegates* to the budget line *Affiliations*, increasing UMSU's NUS affiliation fee to \$72000.

Moved: Hannah Buchan

Seconded: Naomi Smith

CARRIED

Dissent noted from Chris Melenhorst, Josh Bruni, Allen Xiao, Andie Moore, Raiyaan Rubina

9.2. UMSU Condemns Duncan Maskell's Comments Against the Lockdown

Whilst framing the very real life and death debate about Victoria's lockdown as some kind of philosophical exercise, Melbourne Uni's Vice Chancellor, Duncan Maskell, came out publicly against the lockdown in the Sydney Morning Herald last week. The VC suggested we need to consider what should be our "appetite...for disease and mortality associated with this virus" and claimed the lockdown has done 'more harm than good'. He suggests the harm to the economy could outstrip the harm to the health of the population that would result from reopening the economy. He said "If that decision stops people dying now from the virus, what are the economic consequences of that for people and how will that play out in terms of future mortality? It would be crazy if, hypothetically, we stop 100 people [dying] from the virus but over the next two years, 200 people died from [the effects of] poverty and mental health." The implication is clear: he wants to strip back necessary health measures for the sake of the business profits.

The Lockdown in Victoria is necessary to stop the spread of a dangerous virus that has killed almost a million people worldwide and has been found to have continuing health effects in younger people who may beat the virus in the short term. Duncan poses the decision to save as many lives as possible from this virus as a 'difficult decision' that should consider the 'tragedy that young people's lives are being interrupted'. The University sector has been thrown into crisis by Covid-19, due to the loss of international student revenue. Duncan is not thinking about the people who will be impacted by an economic crisis, or the mental health of students when he made this public stance, he is thinking of his own pockets, and already bloated paycheck. If Duncan really cared about giving students support in this difficult time, why is there not more being given to financial support for students by the university? If he cares so much about international students, why does he say nothing about their inability to access the same kinds of support from the government that domestic students can? And where was the concern about poverty and mental illness when the university decided to sack 450+ staff recently? It's important that the student union recognise his statements for what they are; a willingness to throw away the lives of students and staff for the sake of profit.

Multiple Councillors spoke in favour of the motion

Motion 8:

UMSU condemns the public statements of the VC on ending the lockdown in Victoria
UMSU Reaffirms its support of the lockdown in Victoria

Actions

UMSU will make posts in opposition to the VC's stance on its social media and in e-mails to students

Moved: Briana Symonds-Manne

Seconded: Nick Reich

CARRIED

10. Motions Without Notice

10.1. Farrago Unionised Print Company

Preamble: The following report consists of a further investigation into PrintGraphics PrintGreen and Half-Price printing, after new information was brought to our attention. We have found the initial report presented to the council incorrect, as the returned quotes for *Farrago* specifics were based on two different types of printing (see page 2, 'digital and offset printing'). It was also brought to our attention that PrintGraphics is not a scab shop, apparently pay above award wages and have not let any of their staff go during COVID-19. On behalf of the team, I (Bethany) would like to apologise for not confirming this with Print Graphics PrintGreen at the beginning of the initial investigation.

We would also like to acknowledge that according to Lachlan Mullins (Print Organiser at **AMWU**) "*PrintGraphics* is not considered a unionised site according to our records".

I can also confirm *Farrago* sent an email to **AMWU** on June 17th seeking further information for the initial investigation and we received no response. Mullins offered another print company '*Gunn & Taylor*'. The *Farrago* Editors will pursue this suggestion.

'Scab' Claims:

I reached out to Nigel Quirk, a director at PrintGraphics PrintGreen, and our main contact, and asked for a response in regards to the claim PrintGraphics PrintGreen is a SCAB shop.

- He provided these contacts (Seth Unmack and Paul Clifton) to vouch for the union 'friendliness' of PrintGraphics Printgreen. Attempts were made to follow up these references, however our inquiries have yet to be responded to. Contacts for these references are included at the bottom of the report.
- Paul Clifton (National Organiser | **NTEU**) provided a written reference attached in this report.
- PrintGraphics PrintGreen print for the **TWU** (Transport Workers Union) and the **ACTU** (Australian Council of Trade Unions)
- He has also provided the private information he is a union member himself, which is information.

In response to our questions Nigel responded:

"As previously stated we have union members and always welcome the AMWU at any time.

We understand the safety net the union provides workers, our staff are more than welcome to join any union.

Our staff retention is ridiculously high, our average years of service for a company is approx 15 years, people don't leave because we look after our family.

We pay well above the award wage.

Our preferred Super is Media Super which is an industry Fund endorsed by the AWMU.

I think [a] really important aspect of looking after the community is also in the Environment, we have put a lot of effort (and expense) in being as sustainable as possible.

We just invested in a 'Green Project' \$3 million press and we have certified as ISO 14001 plus our regular tree planting days....and the list goes on.."

New Information has also emerged regarding the quotes provided to *Farrago* during the initial investigation. Due to the drastic price difference between PrintGraphics Printgreen and McPhersons Printing (\$8,000 and \$9990 respectively) and Half-Price printing and IMPACT Printing (\$3790 and \$3932 respectively), *Farrago* investigated further, with fears of underquoting or misunderstanding of *Farrago* specifics (the measurements, page count and paper/ink quality etc - included at the bottom).

Digital Printing and Offset Printing:

There are two types of printing of publications; digital and offset. This was brought to the attention of the Editors today (Monday the 28th of September).

Offset Printing:

Offset is the most cost-effective way of printing 500-700+ magazines, and uses a large outlay to create a 'template', and create the magazine via press per unit. To break this down, it costs a lot (up to \$1000) to create the template, and every copy made from that is exponentially cheaper. *Farrago*, which traditionally prints 1000+ copies and uses this method. The quality of printing is much higher in Offset than digital, and requires specialised machinery to create and use templates. PrintGraphics and McPherson's provided quotes for Offset printing (McPherson's does not have digital capabilities, they specialise in Offset printing). Nigel apologised for not bringing digital printing to our attention, as he thought the drop in *Farrago* numbers was a one-off, and we made it clear we wanted a consistent magazine over the year.

Digital Printing:

Digital printing becomes more cost effective when you are printing under 500 copies. The tipping point between digital and offset in terms of cost is around 500-700, but there is no clear line. Both IMPACT and Half-Price Printing were quoting for digital printing, as we requested 400 copies (they assumed digital).

To be clear - two of the four companies quoted us for a different way of printing, which is much cheaper.

Considerations in regards to digital vs offset printing:

- Digital is much cheaper for 400 copies, although lower in quality
- Consistency over the year. Change in printing method will change the look/feel

Considerations in regards to Half-price Printing vs PrintGraphics:

- Half-Price Printing can only do digital printing, and not offset. This becomes an issue for future years, when *Farrago* returns to its 1000+ copies
- Half-Price printing does not have a mail-house. Copies will be delivered to Union House and post organised from there OR they hire an external mail house (Potentially AUS Post) for an additional cost.
- PrintGraphics Print Green can match Half-Price printing for digital printing of *Farrago*.
- PrintGraphics uses more sustainable and environmentally friendly materials and methods - while not the ultimate determination, this is something the Media department value

Conclusion:

The direction to change print companies has been organised based on factual inaccuracies and should be re-opened for further consideration. We encourage Students' Council to consider the twelve year relationship that *Farrago* has had with PrintGraphics PrintGreen. The external research this secondary investigation has provided supports that PrintGraphics PrintGreen is a company UMSU should be comfortable in associating with. What we see here is a competitive cost, as well as the most sustainable options, with the company investing in an entirely sustainable printer. The information we have acquired is a reason to reconsider the direction to change print companies. This decision has implications beyond our year, but for further years to come and will redirect millions of student dollars as a result. In regards to the statement provided for Lachlan Mullins, PrintGraphics does in fact align with a number of AMWU standards and prins for a number of other unions.

Actions for now:

Edition Three of *Farrago* will be printed with PrintGraphics Print Green as indicated previously and agreed upon in council. We will trial-print a digital print version, to compare quality and price, based on the temporary cut in printed copies (under 500).

Contacts for PrintGraphics PrintGreen references:

Seth Unmack

Editor

AEU

9418 4841

Paul Clifton

National Organiser

NTEU

9254 1910

Reference from Paul Clifton:

From: Paul Clifton [mailto:pclifton@nteu.org.au]
Sent: Monday, 28 September 2020 2:52 PM
To: Denis Weekley
Subject: Testimonial from NTEU

Dear Denis

I am writing to confirm that the NTEU National Office has engaged PrintGraphics to print all of our magazines for at least the last decade (if not more).

We have consistently found PrintGraphics' work to be of high quality, well priced, efficient and reliable, and Denis to be always exceptionally professional, knowledgeable, helpful and friendly.

We have no hesitation in recommending them highly for any union or education work.

Yours faithfully

Paul Clifton

Paul Clifton
National Organiser (Publications)
National Tertiary Education Union

PO Box 1323, South Melbourne VIC 3205

03 9254 1910
0424 947 992



...

[Message clipped] [View entire message](#)

Farrago Magazine Specifications:

Farrago Monthly Magazine 80pp Plus 4pp Cover With 3 Leafs Perferatored

Client supplies: Fully formatted, output ready file with all imagery embedded and a complete set of laser proofs.

Pre press: Printgraphics to supply proofs & output to plate.

Specifications:-

Printed: Outside Cover - 4 colour process

Inside Cover - 4 colour process

Text- 4 colour process throughout

Stock: Cover - 300 GSM Monza Gloss 99% recycled

Text 72pp - 100 GSM Ecostar uncoated 100% recycled

Text 8pp - 115 GSM Monza Gloss 99% recycled

Production: Print, **perforate 3 leafs (vertical) on gloss section**, fold, fusebind, trim, pack in standard cartons

& deliver to Melbourne

Finished size: Open 297 x 420mm, Folded 297 x 210mm

Quantity:	1,750	2,000	2,500	3,000
------------------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Bethany and Sarah spoke to their moving rights outlining the differences between the printing types, the costs and unionism.

Gurpreet indicated he believed that Print Graphics was a scab shop and had evidence to prove it. Hannah K – why didn't we get all the quotes from all the companies?

Bethany indicated that they didn't request the normal numbers due to COVID.

Bethany said that PrintGraphics print for lots of unions so is not a scab shop. Half Price printing do not have the capability to print over 1000 copies in offset printing.

Josh Bruni indicated that AWU are not scabs and said a number of points regarding differing opinions of scabs and different unions.

Action: Council rescinds Motion 8 from Council 14(20) for Farrago to move to Half-price Printing, and remain with PrintGraphics PrintGreen' for the remainder of 2020.

Moved: Bethany Cherry

Seconded: Sarah Peters

Max moved the following motion.

Motion: To direct the UMSU CEO to work with the UMSU Comms department to get a more thorough report into printing methods, shops and quotes to settle this issue once and for all.

Environmental considerations need to be taken in to account, with a high standard of recycled paper and environmental printing required.

Mover: Max Dowell

Secunder: Tree Smith

Bethany apologised for inaccurate reporting earlier but suggested that this motion is about now, and not the future. Farrago needs answers now to deal with this issue.

Motion 9: To direct the UMSU CEO to work with the UMSU Comms department to get a more thorough report into printing methods, shops and quotes to settle this issue once and for all. Environmental considerations need to be taken in to account, with a high standard of recycled paper and environmental printing required.

Mover: Max Dowell

Secunder: Tree Smith

CARRIED

Council resumed talking about the rescinding of the other motion.

Sarah asked for an amendment that "to continue the rescinding with half price printing until we have the report from the CEO and Comms

Procedural motion: To move straight to a vote

Mover: Tree Smith

CARRIED

Motion 10: Council rescinds Motion 8 from Council 14(20) for Farrago to move to Half-price Printing, and remain with PrintGraphics PrintGreen' for the remainder of 2020.

Moved: Bethany Cherry

Seconded: Sarah Peters

CARRIED

11. Other Business

12.1 - SDA

Preamble:

respect that. She suggested that everyone take a breather after this Council and think about how we can make it better.

12. Next Meeting

Friday October 16, 1:00pm

13. Close

Meeting closed at 1308